

## BYZANTINE CHURCHES OF SELYMBRIA\*

PAUL MAGDALINO

THE title of this paper may surprise those familiar with the article in which S. Eyice in effect pronounced the funeral oration of the last Byzantine monument inside the walls of Selymbria, modern Silivri.<sup>1</sup> It was thanks only to preservation in the Istanbul Archaeological Museum of certain monogram capitals from this former church that Eyice was able to identify it as a foundation of Alexios Apokaukos, *parakoimomenos* and *megas doux* (d. 1345).<sup>2</sup> The very appearance of the building would have remained conjectural but for another chance survival—in this case, some old photographs of a hitherto unidentified ruin.<sup>3</sup>

There is, however, written evidence for the Byzantine churches of Selymbria, most of which has been overlooked. It is worth presenting in full, since it does much to enhance our picture of a town which was one of the main centers of the Empire during its final decline. From 1381 to 1399 Selymbria was the capital of the Thracian appanage ruled by Andronikos IV Palaiologos (d. 1385) and his son John VII;<sup>4</sup> then and later the

powerful Leontares family were connected with it.<sup>5</sup> The city was one of the last places to fall to the Turks, having remained in Byzantine hands until 1453.<sup>6</sup>

The most important evidence is supplied by one of the lesser-known literary lights of the fourteenth century, Philotheos of Selymbria,<sup>7</sup> the author of a spirited pro-Hesychast *Dialogue* and several homiletic works.<sup>8</sup> In one of these, a laudation of Makarios, a refugee monk from Asia Minor who lived in Constantinople in the first half of the fourteenth century, Philotheos mentions something about his own life.<sup>9</sup> He was born at Dakibyze (modern Gebze) near Nikomedia, the son of a priest called John, and was baptized Philemon. When he was fifteen his father died, leaving him in the care of his uncle Sabbas, a disciple of Makarios. Sabbas sent the boy to a school, where he received a secondary education. Later he entered the monastic life and took the name Philotheos.

\* In addition to the specific acknowledgments mentioned below, I wish to express my gratitude to Dr. Elizabeth Zachariadou and Professor Ihor Ševčenko for their helpful comments, and to the Dumbarton Oaks Center for Byzantine Studies for providing access to the previously unpublished material presented here.

<sup>1</sup> S. Eyice, "Alexis Apocauque et l'église byzantine de Sélymbria (Silivri)," *Byzantion*, 34 (1964), 77–104, esp. 103 note 2: "A Silivri, dans ces dernières années, à peu près tous les monuments historiques ont disparu sans distinction d'importance ni d'époque."

<sup>2</sup> *Ibid.*, 86–93.

<sup>3</sup> O. Feld, "Noch einmal Alexios Apokaukos und die Byzantinische Kirche von Selymbria (Silivri)," *Byzantion*, 37 (1967), 57–65.

<sup>4</sup> Ducas, *Istoria Turco-Bizantina (1341–1462)*, ed. V. Grecu (Bucharest, 1958), 83, 86; F. Miklosich and J. Müller, *Acta et diplomata graeca medii aevi sacra et profana* (Vienna, 1860–90) (hereafter Miklosich-Müller), II, 360; J. W. Barker, *Manuel II Palaeologus (1391–1425): A Study in Late Byzantine Statesmanship* (New Brunswick, N.J., 1968), 41, 51–52, 491–93.

<sup>5</sup> Miklosich-Müller, II, 401, 502–3; see *infra*, note 51; H. Hunger, *Johannes Chortasmenos (ca. 1370–ca. 1436/37), Briefe, Gedichte, und kleine Schriften*, WByzSt, 7 (Vienna, 1969), 127–28.

<sup>6</sup> Ducas, ed. Grecu, 321.

<sup>7</sup> H.-G. Beck, *Kirche und theologische Literatur im byzantinischen Reich* (Munich, 1959), 776–77; G. Mercati, *Notizie di Procoro e Demetrio Cidone, Manuele Caleca e Teodoro Meliteniota ed altri appunti per la storia della teologia e della letteratura bizantina del secolo XIV*, ST, 56 (Vatican City, 1931), 246–48.

<sup>8</sup> Philotheos' writings are preserved in two MSS: cod. Patm. 366, fol. 369ff.; cod. Karmariotissa 51 (53), fols. 86r–109v, 302r–321v. See I. Sakkelion, *Πατριακή Βιβλιοθήκη* (Athens, 1890), 167; A. Tsakopoulos, *Περιγραφικός κατάλογος τῶν χειρογράφων τῆς Βιβλιοθήκης τοῦ Οἰκουμηνικοῦ Πατριαρχείου*, I, Τμήμα χειρογράφων Παναγίας Καμαριωτίσσης (Istanbul, 1953), 93–98. On the *Dialogue*, Philotheos' most important work, see M. Jugie, *DTC*, XI, 2, cols. 1798–99; Mercati, *loc. cit.*

<sup>9</sup> Ed. A. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, Μαυρογορδάτειος Βιβλιοθήκη, in 'Ελλ. Φιλολ. Σύλλ., Suppl. 17 (1886), 57–58.

Philotheos became metropolitan of Selymbria not later than 1365/66, when he issued an excommunication of Nikephoros Gregoras.<sup>10</sup> He was still in office in 1379/80, when he signed a Gospel Book that he had copied.<sup>11</sup> *Theophilos* of Selymbria is recorded as a signatory of an act of February 1389 copied into the synodal register;<sup>12</sup> however, a *sigillion* issued to Vatopedi in April of the same year bears the original signature of *Philotheos* of Selymbria.<sup>13</sup> Either Philotheos was temporarily replaced by Theophilos, or the copyist wrote Theophilos for Philotheos, which is more likely. At any rate, April 1389 is the terminus post quem for his death.

As metropolitan of Selymbria, Philotheos wrote an encomium of the local patron saint, Agathonikos, supposedly a native of Nikomedia who had been brought to Selymbria and beheaded by order of Maximianus Galerius.<sup>14</sup> By the fourteenth century the head was the only relic remaining in Selymbria; the rest of the body was generally believed to have been taken by the Latins,<sup>15</sup> although even before 1204 it is likely that most of the relics were not in Selymbria but in the saint's martyrion at Constantinople.<sup>16</sup> The encomium is a work of civic and personal

propaganda expressing immediate concern with the Turkish danger.<sup>17</sup> It was probably written before 1381, since it contains no reference to the Emperor Andronikos IV who resided at Selymbria after that date.

Toward the end of the encomium is an account of some miracles performed by Agathonikos' head. This section, published below, contains interesting references to the churches of Selymbria in Philotheos' day. Mingarelli summarized but did not reproduce it in his publication of excerpts from the text in cod. Nanian. 309 (now Venice, Bibl. Marc., II, 168);<sup>18</sup> besides, this text, although interesting as a product of Selymbria, was copied a century after the work's composition.<sup>19</sup> The other manuscript containing the encomium, cod. Kamariotissa 51, is in the author's own hand,<sup>20</sup> and includes a "miracle" left out of the later copy, no doubt because it was considered to have been recorded for unworthy personal reasons.

<sup>17</sup> For appeal to Selymbrian local sentiment, cf. PG, 154, cols. 1232–33, 1237. Personal propaganda is evident in the fourth "miracle" ascribed to Agathonikos (see text *infra*), and perhaps in the very conception of a work celebrating a hero who, like Philotheos, came from Nikomedia via Constantinople to Selymbria; see the joint laudation of Nikomedia and Selymbria, in PG, 154, cols. 1232–33. For concern with the Turkish threat, see lines 38–39, 46–48 of the excerpt published below, and the prayer with which Philotheos concludes: ὁρᾷς γὰρ ὅσα καὶ οἷα (leg. ὅσων καὶ οἷων) νῦν τὰ Ῥωμαίων ἐμπέπλησται πράγματα, ἥπερ ἄλλοτε ποτε ὁρᾷς ὅσοις περικυκλούμεθα κακοῖς καὶ ἡμεῖς μάλιστα οἱ ἐπὶ τὴν σὴν πόλιν οἰκοῦντες; ὁρᾷς ὅπως τὰ τῶν πολεμίων βέλη ἐπ' αὐτῶν σχεδὸν τῶν ἐπάλλεων ἵπτανται, καὶ οὐδεὶς ὁ βοηθήσων ἡμῖν . . . (cod. Kamariotissa 51, fols. 309<sup>v</sup>–310<sup>r</sup>).

<sup>18</sup> G. L. Mingarelli, *Graeci codices manuscripti apud Nanios Patricios Venetos asservati* (Bologna, 1784), 536 (PG, 154, cols. 1239–40).

<sup>19</sup> In 1481 the scribe, a monk Gregory, dedicated this and its companion volume to the monastery of the Savior in Selymbria: A. Ehrhard, *Überlieferung und Bestand der hagiographischen und homiletischen Literatur der griechischen Kirche*, III, TU, 52 (1939), 245, 250.

<sup>20</sup> This is evident from the author's corrections on fols. 306<sup>v</sup>–307<sup>v</sup>, and from a comparison of the script with those of the Princeton Gospel Book, the excommunication of Gregoras (Vind. Hist. gr. 47, fol. 250<sup>v</sup>; I am grateful to Fr. Darrouzès for lending me his photograph), and the annotations and substitutions in the *Dialogue* in Patm. 366.

<sup>10</sup> Miklosich-Müller, I, no. 229, p. 490; J. Darrouzès, *Le Registre synodal du patriarchat byzantin au XIV<sup>e</sup> siècle*, AOC, 12 (Paris, 1971), 57. Philotheos' closest known predecessor was one Esaias, recorded in 1355: Miklosich-Müller, I, 433.

<sup>11</sup> Scribal colophon in Princeton, Art Museum, cod. 57, fol. 170<sup>v</sup>; see *Illuminated Greek Manuscripts from American Collections*, ed. G. Vikan (Princeton, 1973), 196–97. I am grateful to Dr. Vikan for bringing this to my attention.

<sup>12</sup> Miklosich-Müller, II, 129.

<sup>13</sup> I am most grateful to Fr. Jean Darrouzès for this information.

<sup>14</sup> BHG<sup>3</sup>, 43. See H. Delehay, "Saints de Thrace et de Mésie," *AnalBoll*, 31 (1912), 245–47; *idem*, *Les Origines du culte des martyrs*, SubsHag, 20 (Brussels, 1933), 244.

<sup>15</sup> PG, 154, col. 1237B–C.

<sup>16</sup> *Kniga palomnik' Antonija arhiepiskopa Novgorodskago*, ed. Hr. M. Loparev, Pravoslavnyj Palestinskij Sbornik, 51 (St. Petersburg, 1899), 31; trans. B. de Khitrowo, *Itinéraires russes en Orient* (Geneva, 1889), 106; R. Janin, *La Géographie ecclésiastique de l'empire byzantin*. I, *Le Siège de Constantinople et le Patriarcat Oecuménique*, pt. 3, *Les Eglises et les monastères* (Paris, 1969), 7–8.

Istanbul, Greek Patriarchate, Kamariotissa 51 (53)=I

Venice, Biblioteca Marciana, II, 168=V

I fol. 309<sup>r</sup>V fol. 750<sup>r</sup>V fol. 750<sup>v</sup>

(non habet V)

I fol. 309<sup>v</sup>

- 1 Βασιλεὺς Μανουὴλ ὁ Πορφυρογέννητος τὴν ἑαυτοῦ κεφαλὴν ἔχων  
νενοσηκυῖαν ἐπὶ πλείστον δῆτινα χρόνον, ἐπεκαλεῖτο τὸν ἅγιον εἰς  
βοήθειαν· ὅθεν καὶ τὴν σεβασμίαν κάραν αὐτοῦ εἰληφώς, καὶ ἀπηρωρη-  
μένην ποιήσας τῇ κεφαλῇ ὥραν οὐχὶ συχνήν, ἀπήλλαξε τῆς νόσου  
5 τελέως, καὶ ὑγιεινὴν ἀποκατέστησεν. Ὁ βασιλεὺς οὖν θεασάμενος τὸ  
συμβάν παραδόξως, ἀμείβεται τῷ ἁγίῳ δῶρον ἀντάξιον. Ποῖον δὲ  
τοῦτο; Τὸν καθολικὸν νεὼν τουτονὶ ἀνεγείρει τὸν στερρὸν καὶ ἀδάμαντα  
εἰς ὄνομα τοῦ ἁγίου, ἔτι δὲ καὶ ἐξ ἀρχιεπισκοπῆς πατριαρχικῆς προεβί-  
βασεν εἰς μητρόπολιν προσηκόντως τὴν αὐτοῦ ἐκκλησίαν καὶ πόλιν.
- 2 Ὅστερον δὲ καὶ Ἀλέξιος ὁ μέγας δούξ, ὃς ἦν εἰς τῶν Ἀποκαύκων  
καὶ κρείττων κατὰ γένος, ἀνὴρ πλούτῳ τε κομῶν καὶ δόξῃ, προσέτι γε  
μὴν δραστήριος καὶ ὀξύς λιαν, ἔτι δ' αὖ ἀγχίνους καὶ περιδέξις τὰ ἐς  
πάντα, ἔν τε βουλαῖς δηλαδὴ καὶ ἐμπειρίαις στρατηγικαῖς, θαλαττίαις  
καὶ ἡπειρωτικαῖς, καὶ πολιτικοῖς πράγμασιν, ἀμειβόμενος τῷ μάρτυρι  
15 διὰ τινὰ περίστασιν αὐτοῦ, ναὸν ἀνίστησιν ἕτερον κάλλιστον κατὰ τὰς  
Ἀμμου, ἐν ᾧ ὁ ἅγιος τετελείωται τὸν μαρτυρικὸν δίαυλον, ὃς ἔτι  
περισώζεται καὶ καθορᾶται.
- 3 Ἀλλὰ καὶ πρὸ βραχέος ὁ παντάριστος βασιλεὺς Ἰωάννης Παλαιολό-  
γος ὁ μέγας, νόσῳ δεινῇ περιπεσὼν, ἡ σεβασμία κεφαλὴ καὶ ἱερὰ τοῦ  
20 ἁγίου ἐκ θείας ἐπιπνοίας ἐπὶ τὰ ἀνάκτορα σταλεῖσα καὶ ἀφικομένη,  
εὐθὺς ἀνερρώσθη καὶ τῆς μεγίστης νόσου ἀπηλλάγη κατὰ μικρόν. Ὅθεν  
ὁ βασιλεὺς οὕτως διὰ τὴν τοῦ θαύματος, ἐνέργειαν τοῦ ἁγίου, τῷ  
ἱερῷ Ἀγαπίῳ ἐκείνῳ τῷ εἰσκεκομηκότῃ τὴν θείαν κάραν, τῷ κλήρῳ  
αὐτοῦ συγκατήλεξε τῷ βασιλικῷ, καὶ τετίμηκεν ὡς εἰκός.
- 4 Βούλεται δ' ὁ λόγος καὶ ἕτερον προσθεῖναι διήγημά τε καὶ θαῦμα.  
Τινὲς τῶν τοῦ κλήρου τοῦμοῦ τῶν λιαν φθονερῶν καὶ ματαίων νεω-  
τεριστάμενοι, καθ' ἡμῶν εἰς βασιλεῖς καὶ πατριάρχας πολλὰ κατειπόντες,  
καὶ λιβέλλους δεδοκότες κρύφα, ὥχοντο ἀπιόντες, τοῦτο μὲν καὶ ὡς  
ἀπαρρησίαστοι καὶ οὐδενὸς λόγου ἄξιοι ἀνθρωπίσκοι, τοῦτο δὲ καὶ  
30 ὡς μάταια καὶ ψευδῇ λέγοντες, πλήν τριῶν κεφαλαίων κρατηθέντων  
καὶ ἐξετασθέντων συνοδικῶς ὡς δὴθεν ἀληθῆ ὄντων· περὶ τε τοῦ ἄμβω-  
νος ὅτι μετετέθη διὰ τὸ τῆς ἐκκλησίας στενωτάτον· περὶ τε μαρμάρων  
ἐδαφικῶν τῆς ἐκκλησίας τοῦ μάρτυρος Ἀλεξάνδρου ἔξω τοῦ ἄστεος ὅτι  
ἐν τῷ τῆς μητροπόλεως τρικλίνῳ ἐνεβλήθησαν ψευδῶς φλυαρούντων·  
35 καὶ μάλιστα περὶ θείων ἱερῶν ἀργῶν κειμένων παντάπασι, ὅτι διε-  
πράθησαν δι' ἀνάγκην ὑπὲρ αἰχμαλώτων καὶ τῆς πόλεως, καὶ ὀχύρωμα  
ἐγεγόνει διὰ τὴν τῶν Ἀγαρηνῶν ἐπιβουλὴν τηνικαῦτα, ἐφ' ᾧ πάλιν  
ὡς ἱερὰ θεία εἶεν καὶ περισώζεσθαι ἐν τινὶ εὐαγεῖ οἴκῳ. Τούτων ἐξεταζο-  
μένων συνοδικῶς πλείστον δῆτινα χρόνον σὺν διασκέψει μακρᾷ, θεία  
40 συνάρσει καὶ βοηθείᾳ, καὶ βασιλικῇ χειρὶ, πατριαρχικῇ τε αὖ καὶ συνο-  
δικῇ θείᾳ γνώμῃ καὶ εὐθύτητι, ἐν τῇ τοῦ μάρτυρος Ἀγαθονίου μνήμῃ,  
ὡ τοῦ θαύματος, τὰ τῆς ὑποθέσεως διελύθησαν, μικρὸν πρόσθεν τὸ  
θριγγίον φρουρὸν γεγονός, τῆς θαλάσσης σφοδρῶς ταραχθείσης ὅτε  
ταῦτ' ἐγένετο, διὰ τὴν τῶν βασκάνων οἶμαι ὠμότητα· πρὸς δέ, μετ'  
45 ὀλίγον καὶ τὸ ἐπίνειον παρὰ τῶν Ἰσμαηλιτῶν σκυλευθὲν ὡς γεγονὸς  
ἄφρακτον καθάπαξ, κατακέκαυσται καὶ ἐρείπιον γέγονεν.

11 τοῦ γένους V, δόξει IV. 13-14 post θαλαττίαις om. καὶ ἡπειρωτι-  
καῖς add. πρὸς τούτοις V. 19 ἡ σεβασμία καὶ ἱερὰ V. 22-23 leg. τὸν  
ἱερέα Ἀγάπιον ἐκείνον τὸν εἰσκεκομικότα. 31 leg. ἀληθῶν. 43 cod.  
θρυγγίον.

## Translation

1 The Emperor Manuel Porphyrogennetos, who had long had an affliction in his head, called on the saint for help; taking that most revered head and suspending it above his own for no great length of time, he cured this completely of the disease and restored it to health. The Emperor, considering that which had happened contrary to all expectation, rewarded the saint with a comparable gift. What was it? He raised this firm and unshakable church in the saint's name; furthermore, he fittingly promoted his church and city to the status of a metropolis from that of a patriarchal archbishopric.

2 Later, Alexios the *megas doux*, who was one of the Apokaukoi and of most worthy ancestry, a man flourishing in wealth and glory, most energetic besides and extremely sharp, keen-witted too and capable in everything—in deliberations, that is, and military operations, both on land and sea, and in political matters; he, paying gratitude to the martyr for some circumstance, erected another most beautiful church at Ammoi, where the saint had finished his race of martyrdom. This is still preserved and can be seen.

3 And a short time ago, (when) the most excellent Emperor John Palaiologos the Great<sup>21</sup> fell victim to a terrible illness, the most holy and revered head of the saint was, by divine inspiration, sent to the palace; and when it arrived, he immediately felt better and in a little while was cured of that formidable sickness. And thus this Emperor, because of the miraculous action of the saint, appointed the priest Agapios, who had brought the head, to the palace clergy, and rewarded him fittingly.

4 My discourse calls for another miracle story. Some of the over envious and vain among my clergy revolted, and made many accusations against me to the emperors and patriarchs, and produced libels in secret, but they were dismissed, both as little men worthy of no consideration who had no right to talk, and as speakers of falsehood and inanity. Three charges were, however, retained and examined by the synod as being supposedly true: concerning the ambo, that this was removed because of the extreme narrowness of the church; concerning marble paving-stones belonging to the church of the martyr Alexander outside the town,<sup>22</sup> that they were removed to the metropolitan palace (this was just lying chatter); and especially concerning holy and precious objects lying idle all over the place, that these were sold of necessity for the sake of captives and of the town,<sup>23</sup> and were used to pay for fortifications because of the Hagarenes' attack<sup>24</sup>—sold, however, on condition that they would again become sacred and holy and would be kept in some pious foundation. When these matters had been examined by the synod over a long period, with much deliberation, by divine intervention and succor, by imperial action, and by divine consensus and justice of the patriarch and synod, the affair was resolved—Oh miracle!—on the feast of the martyr Agathonikos.<sup>25</sup> Shortly before, the harbor wall had been destroyed, the sea then being violently disturbed, I imagine because of the outrageousness of those calumniators; moreover, a short time afterward, now that the harbor was unfortified, it was sacked by the Ishmaelites, burned, and reduced to ruin.

<sup>21</sup> Most probably John V, rather than his grandson John VII.

<sup>22</sup> No doubt the martyr of this name whose relics were venerated at Drizipara in Thrace (near modern Karistiran); cf. *BHG*<sup>3</sup>, 48–49; *Theophylacti Simocattae Historiae*, ed. C. de Boor (Leipzig, 1887), 270–71; Delehayé, "Saints de Thrace et de Mésie," 244–45.

<sup>23</sup> The controversial issue of whether religious property could be sold for charitable or military purposes was revived in the fourteenth century; see I. Ševčenko, "Nicolas Cabasilas' 'Anti-Zealot' Discourse: A Reinterpretation," *DOP*, 11 (1957), 151 ff.

<sup>24</sup> John VI Cantacuzene had already strengthened the fortress by the addition of a tower in 1346: Nikephoros Gregoras, II, Bonn ed. (1830), 762. On the walls of Selymbria, see F. Dirimtekin, "La Forteresse byzantine de Selymbria," *Actes du X<sup>e</sup> Congrès International d'Etudes Byzantines*, 1955 (Istanbul, 1957), 127–29. The work of fortification to which Philotheos refers may be that mentioned by the seventeenth-century traveler Evlija Čelebi; see H. J. Kissling, *Beiträge zur Kenntnis Thrakiens im 17. Jahrhundert* (Wiesbaden, 1956), 10.

<sup>25</sup> August 22. Unfortunately, the surviving fourteenth-century synodal register contains no record of the proceedings.

Commentary on §§ 1 and 2

1 The emperor in question is obviously Manuel I Komnenos (1143–80).<sup>26</sup> Manuel spent the Easter of 1167 at Selymbria while on his way to Hungary,<sup>27</sup> and this may well have been the occasion on which he sought the aid of St. Agathonikos, since he was still suffering from injuries incurred during a polo game. It was at some point between 1166 and 1169 that he raised the Selymbrian see to metropolitan status.<sup>28</sup>

The church was evidently the cathedral, and it is therefore certain that Manuel did not build an entirely new church, but restored or remodeled an existing structure; an ambo mentioned in the third miracle was surely a survival from preiconoclastic times.<sup>29</sup> The building was clearly dedicated to Agathonikos, which poses a problem as far as its later history is concerned, because the cathedral mentioned by seventeenth- and nineteenth-century observers was dedicated to the Virgin.<sup>30</sup> Either this was a different church, or the original dedication had changed.

2 Alexios Apokaukos,<sup>31</sup> *parakoimomenos* (1321–41)<sup>32</sup> and *megas doux* (1341–45),<sup>33</sup> was

<sup>26</sup> For epigraphical examples of Manuel's official use of the epithet Porphyrogennetos, see C. Mango, "The Conciliar Edict of 1166," *DOP*, 17 (1963), 324; A. Van Millingen, *Byzantine Constantinople. The Walls of the City and Adjoining Historical Sites* (London, 1899), 187.

<sup>27</sup> John Kinnamos, Bonn ed. (1836), 265; F. Chalandon, *Jean II Comnène (1118–1143) et Manuel I Comnène (1143–1180)* (Paris, 1912), 488.

<sup>28</sup> H. Gelzer, "Zur Zeitbestimmung der griechischen Notitiae Episcopatum," *Jahrbuch für protestantische Theologie*, 12 (1886), 544–47; V. Laurent, *Le Corpus des sceaux de l'empire byzantin*, V, *L'Eglise*, I, 1 (Paris, 1963), 645–46.

<sup>29</sup> T. F. Mathews, *The Early Churches of Constantinople: Architecture and Liturgy* (University Park, Pa.-London, 1971), 178–79, 180 note 4.

<sup>30</sup> See Appendices *infra*.

<sup>31</sup> For prosopographical details, see D. I. Polemis, *The Doukai. A Contribution to Byzantine Prosopography* (London, 1968), 101; for Apokaukos' public career, see K. P. Matschke, *Fortschritt und Reaktion in Byzanz im 14. Jahrhundert. Konstantinopel in der Bürgerkriegsperiode von 1341 bis 1354*, *Berliner Byzantinische Arbeiten*, 42 (Berlin, 1971), 133ff.

<sup>32</sup> R. Guiland, *Recherches sur les institutions byzantines*, *Berliner Byzantinische Arbeiten*, 35 (Berlin-Amsterdam, 1967), I, 210.

<sup>33</sup> Cantacuzene, Bonn ed. (1828–32), II, 218; Guiland, *op. cit.*, 550.

head of the administration under Andronikos III, the main power behind the regency government of John V, and the most determined opponent of John Cantacuzene in the most disastrous of Byzantine civil wars. The fulsomeness of Philotheos' description contrasts oddly with the summary treatment of the miracle as such, and with the prophesychast and pro-Cantacuzene sentiments he expresses elsewhere.<sup>34</sup> It is noteworthy that he refers to Apokaukos as being of good family, when Cantacuzene and Gregoras insist to the contrary.<sup>35</sup> Apokaukos may have been well remembered in Selymbria; he is more than once mentioned in connection with the town, and he built his private castle at Epibates in the vicinity.<sup>36</sup> Possibly Philotheos had cause to be grateful to Apokaukos, a fellow Bithynian,<sup>37</sup> or, more likely, he chose his words in deference to living and influential Apokaukoι.<sup>38</sup>

It is tempting to identify the church mentioned by Philotheos with the building known to archeology as the Fatih Camii, and it is perhaps apparently unlikely that Apokaukos would have made two major pious foundations in the same provincial town. This possibility cannot be excluded, however, and on consideration may be preferable. There is no evidence that the Fatih Camii was dedicated to Agathonikos; indeed, both testimonies to popular tradition concerning the building indicate, for what

<sup>34</sup> I.e., the unpublished theological *Dialogue*, and the *Encomium of Makarios*, ed. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, *op. cit.* (note 9 *supra*), 55–57.

<sup>35</sup> Cantacuzene, I, 25, line 4; 117, lines 24–25; II, 89, line 2; Gregoras, II, 577, line 20; 602, line 19. Cf. G. Weiss, *Johannes Kantakuzenos—Aristokrat Staatsmann, Kaiser und Mönch—in der Gesellschaftsentwicklung von Byzanz im 14. Jahrhundert* (Wiesbaden, 1969), 54–56.

<sup>36</sup> Cantacuzene, I, 258; II, 102, 105, 141; Gregoras, II, 602–3. On the remains of the castle at Epibates (Bigados), see A. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, 'Ἀρχαιοφύλαξις καὶ ἐπιγραφαὶ τῆς Θράκης, in 'Ελλ. Φιλολ. Σύλλ., Suppl. 17 (1882–83), 71; Eyice, *op. cit.* (note 1 *supra*), 87.

<sup>37</sup> Cantacuzene, II, 89.

<sup>38</sup> Apokaukos married twice and had several sons and daughters, at least two of whom made noble marriages (Polemis, *op. cit.*, 101 note 13). Two Apokaukoι ranked high under Manuel II; see L. Politis, "Eine Schreiberschule im Kloster τῶν Ὁδηγῶν," *BZ*, 51 (1958), 32; J. M. Spieser, "Les Inscriptions de Thessalonique," *TM*, 5 (1973), 176–77.

they are worth, a dedication to some St. John.<sup>39</sup> There is also the question of the location. The name Ammoi (sands) given to the place where Apokaukos built his church to Agathonikos suggests the proximity of a sandy beach, and this is borne out by Philotheos' statement that the saint was executed by the seashore.<sup>40</sup> The Fatih Camii, however, lay in the center of the elevated medieval citadel.<sup>41</sup> Therefore, it is likely that Apokaukos' church of St. Agathonikos was a different building, and that it stood by the shore outside the walls. This interpretation would give some point to the remark that the church was still standing, which, since it is not applied to the older church rebuilt by Manuel I, can be no more than a rhetorical flourish unless it carries the implication that Apokaukos' foundation had been in danger of destruction, for instance at the hands of Turks raiding outside the walls. Drakos, writing in the nineteenth century, mentions that a church of St. Agathonikos had existed outside the citadel.

A further reminiscence of Alexios Apokaukos' patronage in Selymbria should be mentioned here. This is a note in a synaxarion of 1325, now cod. Kamariotissa 47:

† τὸ παρὸν βιβλίον ἐνι (ἔστι Ts.) τοῦ με(γά)λου δουκός, ἀπὸ τὴν σηλυβρίαν· καὶ δέδωκα (δέδωκεν Ts.) τοῦτο (αὐτὸ Ts.) ἐν τῇ μονῇ τοῦ τιμίου προδρόμου, ἵνα ἀναγινώσκωσι τὰς μνημας τῶν ἁγίων· ὅταν δὲ ἔλθῃ τὸ ἔλεος τοῦ Θεοῦ, ἐν ὅλῃ τῇ κτίσει, πάλιν ἐπιστρέψῃ ἡ βίβλος, ὅμου καὶ τὰ

<sup>39</sup> See notes 52, 53 *infra*. The monogram on a capital, now lost, which nineteenth-century observers claim to have seen in the building, has been resolved as Ἰω(ά)ννης; cf. Eyice, *op. cit.*, 89, 91.

<sup>40</sup> The *comes* Eutolmios brought Agathonikos from Byzantion ἐπὶ τὸν τύραννον Μαξιμιανόν, ἐν ᾧ τόπῳ διῆγεν, Ἄμμου ἐπονομαζομένῳ, ἐν τῇ περιφανεί πόλει Σηλυβρία δηλαδὴ, ἐνθα τοὺς βασιλείους οἴκους εἶχε τηνικαῦτα καὶ τὴν δίαίταν, διὰ τε τὸ χάριεν τοῦ τόπου καὶ εὐάερον καὶ ἐλεύθερον (fol. 308r). Philotheos is more precise in this respect than any of the versions of Agathonikos' *Passio* which I was able to consult (BHG<sup>3</sup>, 39, 39z, 40, 41, 41a, 42), no doubt because he had the location of the church in mind.

<sup>41</sup> Eyice, *op. cit.*, 93.

ἕτερα, ἐν τῇ μονῇ τῆς σηλυβρίας, ἥτοι τοῦ μεγ(ά)λου δουκός.<sup>42</sup>

At the end of the codex is another note in the same hand, under the scribal colophon of 1325:

† δέδωκα τὸ παρὸν ὡς περ δανικὸν ἐν τῇ μονῇ τοῦ τιμίου προδρόμου τῆς πέτρας, ἵνα ἀναγινώσκωσι μνημας ἁγίων ἐν ἔτει ᾿ς ᾿ροα', ἰνδ. ια'.<sup>43</sup>

These notes show that in A.M. 6971, or A.D. 1462/63, part if not all of the movable property of a monastery "of the *megas doux*" in Selymbria was transferred to the house of St. John the Baptist at Petra in Constantinople,<sup>44</sup> with little expectation that it would be restored to its owner before the Second Coming. In view of the fact that the transfer took place in the reign of Mehmet II Fatih, "the Conqueror," it is plausible to identify the monastery of the *megas doux* with the building studied by Eyice and the occasion as that of its conversion into a mosque. It is true that the monograms on the capitals of the Fatih Camii show that Apokaukos built this while he was *parakoimomenos*, but it is likely that he was remembered by most people in his last and highest capacity of *megas doux*, in which he seems to have caught the popular imagination.<sup>45</sup> It is perhaps of some significance that this foundation was a monastery, whereas that mentioned by Philotheos was termed *naos*.

One other passage of Philotheos' encomium deserves mention. Digressing at one point on the subject of the reconquest of Constantinople from the Latins in 1261, Philotheos comments that the Emperor Michael VIII started his reign well but ended it badly, as a Latin sympathizer, "so that in this town of Selys, in the monastery of Christ the all-merciful Savior, his body is to be seen lying

<sup>42</sup> Originally published by Tsakopoulos, *op. cit.* (note 8 *supra*), 85. I have indicated where our readings differ.

<sup>43</sup> *Ibid.*, 86.

<sup>44</sup> Janin, *op. cit.* (note 16 *supra*), 421ff. In 1462 the Petra monastery was given to the Christian mother of Mahmud Pasha, Vizir of Mehmet II; cf. the firman published in Ὁρθόδοξια, 20 (1945), 147-48.

<sup>45</sup> A. Xyngopoulos, Ἅγιος Δημήτριος ὁ Μέγας Δουξ ὁ Ἀπόκαυκος, in Ἑλληνικά, 15 (1957), 122-40.

all bloated because his heterodoxy was so far gone; and also, indeed, because of the excommunication which the most holy Patriarch Arsenios pronounced against him for having deceitfully usurped power from the son of Theodore Laskaris."<sup>46</sup> This passage is interesting for the information that Michael VIII's body was never removed for burial in one of the imperial or aristocratic mausolea in Constantinople, but remained in the monastery of the Savior in Selymbria, where, according to Pachymeres, Michael had reburied the remains of Basil II in 1260 and was himself interred in 1282 after his death near Raidestos.<sup>47</sup> Pachymeres again mentions the monastery in connection with events of the year 1299, and in a context which suggests that the house depended upon the patriarch.<sup>48</sup> It is probably to be identified with the patriarchal monastery which John Kalekas tried to protect in 1343 from the encroachments of neighboring communities.<sup>49</sup> It was still flourishing in 1481.<sup>50</sup>

From the above information, it is obvious that the monastery of the Savior cannot be

identified with any of the others mentioned by Philotheos, or with the Fatih Camii.

There are two other mentions of local monasteries in Byzantine sources, both of the fifteenth century. Short notices in cod. 265 of the monastery of Eikosiphonissa at Kosinitza near Drama record the deaths of Demetrios Leontares (1431) and his son John (1437); the latter "was buried in the monastery of the Prodomos, in Selymbria."<sup>51</sup> As I have already mentioned, there seems to have been a tradition in the nineteenth century that the Fatih Camii had once been dedicated to a St. John—John the Theologian according to Stamoulis,<sup>52</sup> and John the Baptist (Prodomos) according to Drakos.<sup>53</sup> If Drakos is right, and not merely influenced by a knowledge of this note, then it is conceivable that the monastery of the Prodomos was identical with the monastery of the *megas doux*. Demetrios Leontares was buried in the Petra monastery at Constantinople,<sup>54</sup> where, as we have seen, liturgical books from the monastery of the *megas doux* were deposited in 1462/63.

Another Demetrios Leontares, probably John's son, recorded in 1446 that he received a book formerly belonging to the metropolitan Ignatios of Selymbria (John Chortasmenos), from Makarios, "abbot of (the monastery of) St. Marina in the same town."<sup>55</sup>

To summarize, Greek sources of the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries mention the following religious institutions at Selymbria: the metropolitan church of St. Agathonikos rebuilt by Manuel I, a church of St. Agathonikos built by Alexios Apokaukos, a church of St. Alexander outside the town, a patriarchal monastery of Christ the Savior, a monastery of the *megas doux*, a monastery of the Prodomos, and a monastery of

<sup>46</sup> Fol. 308v: ὡς καὶ ἐν τῇ τοῦ Σήλως αὐτῇ πόλει κατὰ τὴν τοῦ Σωτῆρος καὶ πανελεήμονος Χριστοῦ μονήν, τὸ ἑαυτοῦ σῶμα κατακείμενον καθορᾶται ὀγκούμενον, διὰ τὴν προβᾶσαν τῶν δογμάτων διαφορὰν, προσέτι γε μὴν καὶ διὰ τὸν προσφωνηθέντα κατ' αὐτοῦ ἀφορισμὸν παρὰ τοῦ θειοτάτου πατριάρχου Ἀρσενίου, ὡς σφετερισάμενον (leg. σφετερισμένον) ξὺν δόλῳ τὴν τῆς βασιλείας ἀρχὴν ἐξ υἱοῦ Θεοδώρου τοῦ Λάσκαρη; also published, with slight variations, in PG, 154, cols. 1237D–1238A.

<sup>47</sup> George Pachymeres, Bonn ed. (1835), I, 125; II, 107–8 (Gregoras, I, 159). John IV Laskaris, whom Michael had deposed and blinded, seems by contrast to have been buried in the capital and venerated as a saint; cf. I. Ševčenko, "Notes on Stephen, the Novgorodian Pilgrim to Constantinople in the XIV Century," *SOforsch.* 12 (1953), 173–75, who discusses the persistence through the fourteenth century of Arsenite sentiments such as those expressed by Philotheos in the passage quoted above. Mercati (*op. cit.* [note 7 *supra*], 247 note 4) suggested that an encomium of Arsenios at the end of Patm. 366 may be Philotheos' work. Examination of the codex supports this idea, since the encomium is in the same hand as the *Dialogue*, which has the author's autograph annotations.

<sup>48</sup> Pachymeres, II, 281.

<sup>49</sup> Miklosich-Müller, I, no. 103, p. 232. The name of the town is given as Σηβρία—surely a copyist's error.

<sup>50</sup> See note 19 *supra*.

<sup>51</sup> A. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, "Ἐκθεσις παλαιογραφικῶν καὶ φιλολογικῶν ἐρευνῶν ἐν Θράκῃ καὶ Μακεδονίᾳ," in 'Ελλ. Φιλολ. Σύλλ., Suppl. 17 (1882–83), 30; P. Schreiner, *Die Byzantinischen Kleinchroniken*, I (Vienna, 1975), 649.

<sup>52</sup> A. Stamoulis, in 'Ελλ. Φιλολ. Σύλλ., 6 (1872), 246.

<sup>53</sup> See Appendix B *infra*.

<sup>54</sup> S. P. Lampros, *Παλαιολογία καὶ Πελοποννησιακά*, I (Athens, 1912–23), 213–14.

<sup>55</sup> Vatican, cod. Reg. 6, fol. 205v; cf. H. Stevenson, *Codices manuscripti graeci Reginae Suecorum et Pii P.P. II* (Rome, 1898), 6; Hunger, *op. cit.* (note 5 *supra*), 128.





The beginning and ending are the same, and a καλόγηρος (a papás or Monk there) would needs have it to be ὦ σῶσον; I am apt to think it might mean so (but there wants ye N,) for I find it was a word of supplication yet in the antient Amulets, commonly ascribed to ye followers of Basilides; I have a very rare curiosity of which I will give you an account amongst the rest and compare that with this. Coming out from that church on ye wall on ye right hand without, are four figures standing in a small stone about 1½ foot long; an Antient man with a young lad on his left hand holding one hand on his breast and ye other under his cheek. Opposite to him stands a Woman with a young lasse in ye same posture with ye boy. Over was wrote (ye corner being a little broken): ΟΥΝΙΟΣ ΠΡΟΒΟΣ and on ye edge of ye side to ye right hand, ΖΗ. I conclude it to have been the title to his monument by ye word ΖΗ which I have frequently met with all in monuments, perhaps it was onely an indication of their beleif of ye immortality. In another church of ye B.V. is shown ye body of a saint which they call<sup>59</sup> ἁγία ξένη and an old picture of ye V.M. They tell the story [that] after a great shipwrack this body was driven ashore with this picture tyed to it with an Iron chain, and though they never knew whence she came nor what she was yet they for the pictures sake sainted her, and reserved her body and ye picture as objects of devotion to ye people. There is a day set apart (Jan. 24th) in their Legend for this

<sup>59</sup> The sources attesting to the cult of Agia Xení at Silivri from 1614 to the twentieth century are too numerous to list here; for a representative sample, see Eyice, *op. cit.*, 83 note 2; F. W. Hasluck, *Christianity and Islam under the Sultans* (Oxford, 1929), II, 580. It is interesting that Covell distinguishes between the cathedral and the church where the body was kept, and difficult to know how to reconcile this information with that of Drakos (*infra*).

saint, but there they tell another tale of her. The monastery (which I have already mentioned)<sup>60</sup> hath been a very pretty little/ building, fol. 182<sup>r</sup> but now running to ruine, there being no endowments or revenue left to repair it; there is but one old καλόγερος left, who lives only upon what few aspers he can get by ye charity of strangers.

B. Translated excerpts from E. I. Drakos, *Τὰ Θρακικά* (Athens, 1892).

- p. 16 There is an undamaged Byzantine church in the citadel, dedicated to St. Spyridon,<sup>61</sup> decorated with paintings; I regard it as one of the wonders of the Thracian littoral. In ruins is the Byzantine church in the town dedicated to the Prodomos, which the Turks have as a mosque; painted icons are visible on the inside of the apse. This is the monastery of St. John the Fore-runner, which existed in Selymbria before 1437,<sup>62</sup> and to the present day its environs are called the quarter of the metropolis.
- p. 18 The church of the Selymbrians, dedicated to the Birth of the Mother of God, is in a sort of Byzantine style, although the part of it between the episcopal throne and the narthex was completely rebuilt in 1833 during the incumbency of

<sup>60</sup> Fol. 180<sup>v</sup>: "Within ye castle now stands an old monastery so near ye brow of ye cliff as I am confident in very little time it will follow ye fate which ye wall have had." This was probably the monastery seen in the previous century by Pigafetta; see P. Matković, "Putopis Marka Antuna Pigafette u Carigrad od god. 1567," *Jugoslavenska Akademija Znanosti i Umjetnosti, Starine*, 22 (1890), 160: "Questa città fù nomata già *Selimbria* et è picciola. Ha un castello, le cui mura sono tutte minate, dentro al quale sono due monasteri, l'uno de frati, e l'altro di monache."

<sup>61</sup> K. Mavrides, 'Ο ἐν Σηλυβρίᾳ Βυζαντινὸς Ναὸς τοῦ Ἁγίου Σπυρίδωνος, in *Θρακικά*, 9 (1938), 37-44.

<sup>62</sup> Although he refers to no source, Drakos' mention of this date suggests that he knew of the Kosinitza manuscript note (see note 51 *supra*).

Metropolitan Ierotheos of Selymbria; the icon of the Ever-Virgin is covered with silver, and portrays her holding the Once-Begotten, while on the other side it shows the Birth of Our Most Blessed Lady—a curious thing, since all the icons of our churches and houses are painted on one side of the panel only; the locals flatter themselves in saying that this icon is one of those worked by the Evangelist Luke.

[There follows a passage discussing the importance of the icon as an object of pilgrimage, and describing the custom of the “ransoming” of the “slaves of the Virgin”—people who had themselves bound symbolically with a chain and then pledged money to the church in order to be freed.]

p. 19 The church now treasures the relic of St. Xene, whom the citizens revere as a second patron, as well as the holy head of St. Agathonikos who suffered martyrdom here in 290. On the south side of this venerable church there is a sculpture representing the Panagia and the Emperor Justinian,<sup>63</sup> founder of the

church according to tradition, although history does record all that he built. In the courtyard are preserved tombs of the bishops Sophronios and Zacharias; adjoining the church to the south is a wooden, two-storied metropolitan residence erected in 1782. There is in the town another small church dedicated in the name of the Dormition of the Virgin, in which the three priests officiate only during the feast of the Fifteenth of August; it is at the southwest edge in the place called Paraporti, to which one climbs by a stone path as if to an acropolis. It is said that here an old woman betrayed the town on the occasion of its capture by foreigners; it is a lonely and deserted spot on summer days. The citizens say that their lovely home was adorned with almost forty churches, yet only traces or names of a few are preserved, of SS. Demetrios, Panteleimon, the Apostles, and Theodosia in the citadel, and, nearby, of SS. Agathonikos, Anne, and the Blachernae.

<sup>63</sup> For a more sober account of this sculpture, see Papadopoulos-Kerameus, *Ἀρχαιότητες καὶ ἐπιγραφὰι τῆς Θράκης*, 74–75.